

Congressional Budget Office
Washington, D.C.

Estimating the Long-Term Effects of Federal R&D Spending: Bibliography

June 2018

This document accompanies Sheila Campbell and Chad Shirley, “Estimating the Long-Term Effects of Federal R&D Spending: CBO’s Current Approach and Research Needs,” CBO Blog (June 21, 2016), www.cbo.gov/publication/54089.

Literature Reviews

Becker, Bettina. “Public R&D Policies and Private R&D Investment: A Survey of the Empirical Evidence,” *Journal of Economic Surveys*, vol. 29, no. 5 (December 2015), pp. 917–942, <https://doi.org/10.1111/joes.12074>.

Congressional Budget Office, *R&D and Productivity Growth* (June 2005), www.cbo.gov/publication/16635.

Hall, Bronwyn H., Jacques Mairesse, and Pierre Mohnen, “Measuring the Returns to R&D,” in Bronwyn H. Hall and Nathan Rosenberg, eds., *Handbook of the Economics of Innovation*, vol. 2 (Elsevier, 2010), pp. 1033–1082, [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0169-7218\(10\)02008-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0169-7218(10)02008-3).

Martin, Ben R. and Puay Tang, *The Benefits From Publicly Funded Research*, Working Paper 161 (Science Policy Research Unit, University of Sussex, June 2007), www.sussex.ac.uk/spru/research/swps.

National Research Council, *Furthering America’s Research Enterprise* (The National Academies Press, 2014), www.nap.edu/read/18804/chapter/1.

Salter, Ammon J. and Ben R. Martin, “The Economic Benefit of Publicly Funded Basic Research: A Critical Review,” *Research Policy*, vol. 30, no. 3 (March 2001), pp. 509–532, [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0048-7333\(00\)00091-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0048-7333(00)00091-3).

Substitution/Complementarity of Public and Private R&D

Blume-Kohut, Margaret E., Krishna B. Kumar, and Neeraj Sood, “University R&D Funding Strategies in a Changing Federal Funding Environment,” *Science and Public Policy*, vol. 42, no. 3 (June 2015), <https://doi.org/10.1093/scipol/scu054>.

David, Paul A., Bronwyn H. Hall, and Andrew A. Toole, “Is Public R&D a Complement or Substitute for Private R&D? A Review of the Econometric Evidence,” *Research Policy*, vol. 29, no. 4–5 (April 2000), pp. 497–529, [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0048-7333\(99\)00087-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0048-7333(99)00087-6).

Diamond, Arthur M., Jr., “Does Federal Funding ‘Crowd in’ Private Funding of Science?” *Contemporary Economic Policy*, vol. 17, no. 4 (October 1999), pp. 423–431, <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1465-7287.1999.tb00694.x>.

Jensen, Richard, Jerry Thursby, and Marie C. Thursby, *University-Industry Spillovers, Government Funding, and Industrial Consulting*, Working Paper 15732 (National Bureau of Economic Research, February 2010), www.nber.org/papers/w15732.

Levy, David M. and Nestor E. Terklekyj, “Effects of Government R&D on Private R&D Investment and Productivity: A Macroeconomic Analysis,” *The Bell Journal of Economics*, vol. 14, no. 2 (Autumn 1983), pp. 551–561, www.jstor.org/stable/i353458.

Toole, Andrew A., “Does Public Scientific Research Complement Private Investment in Research and Development in the Pharmaceutical Industry?” *Journal of Law and Economics*, vol. 50, no. 1 (February 2007), pp. 81–104, www.jstor.org/stable/10.1086/508314.

Aggregated R&D Studies

Congressional Budget Office, *A Review of Edwin Mansfield’s Estimate of the Rate of Return From Academic Research and Its Relevance to the Federal Budget Process* (April 1993), www.cbo.gov/publication/16596.

Goel, Rajeev K., James E. Payne, and Rati Ram, “R&D Expenditures and U.S. Economic Growth: A Disaggregated Approach,” *Journal of Policy Modeling*, vol. 30, no. 2 (March–April 2008), pp. 237–250, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpolmod.2007.04.008>.

Goolsbee, Austan, “Does Government R&D Policy Mainly Benefit Scientists and Engineers?” *American Economic Review*, vol. 88, no. 2 (May 1998), pp. 298–302, www.jstor.org/stable/116937.

Griliches, Zvi, “Productivity, R&D, and Basic Research at the Firm Level in the 1970s,” in Griliches, ed., *R&D and Productivity: The Econometric Evidence* (University of Chicago Press, 1998), pp. 82–99, www.nber.org/chapters/c8342.

Kokko, Ari, Patrik Gustavsson Tingvall, and Josefin Videnord, “The Growth Effects of R&D Spending in the EU: A Meta-Analysis,” *Economics: The Open-Access, Open-Assessment E-Journal*, vol. 9, no. 2015-40 (November 2015), pp. 1–26, <http://dx.doi.org/10.5018/economics-ejournal.ja.2015-40>.

Mansfield, Edwin, “Basic Research and Productivity Increase in Manufacturing,” *American Economic Review*, vol. 70, no. 5 (December 1980), pp. 863–873, www.jstor.org/stable/1805767.

Mansfield, Edwin, “Academic Research and Industrial Innovation,” *Research Policy*, vol. 20, no. 1 (February 1991), pp. 1–12, [http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0048-7333\(91\)90080-A](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0048-7333(91)90080-A).

Nadiri, M. Ishaq and Theofanis P. Mamuneas, “The Effects of Public Infrastructure and R&D Capital on the Cost Structure and Performance of U.S. Manufacturing Industries,” *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, vol. 76, no. 1 (February 1994), pp. 22–37, www.jstor.org/stable/2109823.

Westmore, Ben, “Innovation and Growth: Considerations for Public Policy,” *Review of Economics and Institutions*, vol. 4, no. 3 (Fall 2013), pp. 1–50, www.rei.unipg.it/rei/issue/view/12.

Wolff, Edward N. and M. Ishaq Nadiri, “Spillover Effects, Linkage Structure, and Research and Development,” *Structural Change and Economic Dynamics*, vol. 4, no. 2 (December 1993), pp. 315–331, [https://doi.org/10.1016/0954-349X\(93\)90022-C](https://doi.org/10.1016/0954-349X(93)90022-C).

Bibliometric/Patent Studies

Adams, James and Zvi Griliches, “Measuring Science: An Exploration,” *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, vol. 93 (November 1996), pp. 12664–12670, www.jstor.org/stable/i202862.

Azoulay, Pierre and others, “Public R&D Investments and Private-Sector Patenting: Evidence From NIH Funding Rules,” *The Review of Economic Studies* (forthcoming), www.restud.com/accepted-papers/.

Goldfarb, Brent, “The Effect of Government Contracting on Academic Research: Does the Source of Funding Affect Scientific Output?” *Research Policy*, vol. 37, no. 1 (February 2008), pp. 41–58, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.respol.2007.07.011>.

Guerzoni, Marco and others, “A New Industry Creation and Originality: Insight From the Funding Sources of University Patents,” *Research Policy*, vol. 43, no. 10 (December 2014), pp. 1697–1706, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.respol.2014.07.009>.

Jacob, Brian and Lars Lefgren, “The Impact of Research Grant Funding on Scientific Productivity,” *Journal of Public Economics*, vol. 95, no. 9–10 (October 2011), pp. 1168–1177, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2011.05.005>.

Jaffe, Adam B. and Gaétan de Rassenfosse, “Patent Citation Data in Social Science Research: Overview and Best Practices,” *Journal of the Association for Information Science and Technology*, vol. 68, no. 6 (January 2017), <https://doi.org/10.1002/asi.23731>.

Narin, Francis, Kimberly S. Hamilton, and Dominic Olivastro, “The Increasing Linkage Between U.S. Technology and Public Science,” *Research Policy*, vol. 26, no. 3 (October 1997), pp. 317–330, [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0048-7333\(97\)00013-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0048-7333(97)00013-9).

Popp, David, “Economic Analysis of Scientific Publications and Implications for Energy Research and Development,” *Nature Energy*, vol. 1 (March 2016), <https://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nenergy.2016.20>.

Roach, Michael and Wesley M. Cohen, “Lens or Prism? Patent Citations as a Measure of Knowledge Flows From Public Research,” *Management Science*, vol. 59, no. 2 (February 2012), pp. 504–525, <https://doi.org/10.1287/mnsc.1120.1644>.

Rosenbloom, Joshua L. and others, “The Effects of Research & Development Funding on Scientific Productivity: Academic Chemistry, 1990–2009,” *PLoS ONE*, vol. 10, no. 9 (September 2015), <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0138176>.

Other Studies

Bloom, Nicholas and others, “Are Ideas Getting Harder to Find?” (draft, March 2018), <https://web.stanford.edu/~chadj/papers.html>.

Blume-Kohout, Margaret E., “Does Targeted, Disease-Specific Public Research Funding Influence Pharmaceutical Innovation?” *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, vol. 31, no. 3 (Summer 2012), pp. 641–660, www.jstor.org/stable/41653819.

Cockburn, I. and R. Henderson, “Absorptive Capacity, Coauthoring Behavior, and the Organization of Research in Drug Discovery,” *Journal of Industrial Economics*, vol. 156, no. 2 (1998), pp. 157–182, <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-6451.00067>.

Kesselheim, Aaron, Yongtian Tina Tan, and Jerry Avorn, “The Roles of Academia, Rare Diseases, and Repurposing in the Development of the Most Transformative Drugs,” *Health Affairs*, vol. 34, no. 2 (2015), <https://doi.org/10.1377/hlthaff.2014.1038>.

Lane, Julia and others, “New Linked Data on Research Investments: Scientific Workforce, Productivity, and Public Value,” *Research Policy*, vol. 44, no. 9 (November 2015), pp. 1659–1671, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.respol.2014.12.013>.

Lerner, Josh, “The Government as Venture Capitalist: The Long-Run Impact of the SBIR Program,” *Journal of Business*, vol. 72, no. 3 (July 1999), pp. 285–318, www.jstor.org/stable/10.1086/jb.1999.72.issue-3.

Moretti, Enrico, Claudia Steinwender, and John Van Reenen, “The Intellectual Spoils of War? Defense R&D, Productivity and Spillovers” (draft, 2016), <https://eml.berkeley.edu/~moretti/military.pdf> (2.4 MB).

Murphy, Kevin M. and Robert H. Topel, “The Value of Health and Longevity,” *Journal of Political Economy*, vol. 114, no. 5 (Oct 2006), pp. 871–904, www.jstor.org/stable/10.1086/508033.

National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine, *Returns to Federal Investments in the Innovation System: Proceedings of a Workshop—in Brief* (The National Academies Press, 2017), <https://doi.org/10.17226/24905>.

Toole, Andrew A., “The Impact of Public Basic Research on Industrial Innovation: Evidence From the Pharmaceutical Industry,” *Research Policy*, vol. 41, no. 1 (February 2012), pp. 1–12, <https://doi.org/10.1002/j.respol.2011.06.004>.